

COUNCIL CHAMBER

Regular Meeting

May 23, 2017

The thirty-fourth meeting of the City Council of Charleston was held this date convening at 5:04 p.m. at City Hall.

A notice of this meeting and an agenda were mailed to the news media May 17, 2017 and appeared in The Post and Courier May 21, 2017 and are made available on the City's website.

PRESENT (12)

The Honorable John J. Tecklenburg, Mayor

Councilmember White	District 1	Councilmember Waring	District 7
Councilmember Williams	District 2	Councilmember Seekings	District 8
Councilmember Lewis	District 3	Councilmember Shahid	District 9
Councilmember Mitchell	District 4	Councilmember Riegel (<i>absent</i>)	District 10
Councilmember Wagner	District 5	Councilmember Moody	District 11
Councilmember Gregorie	District 6	Councilmember Wilson	District 12

Mayor Tecklenburg called the meeting to order at 5:04 p.m.

The Clerk called the roll.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "If you all would like to join, Councilmember Lewis is going to lead us in a prayer and the Pledge of Allegiance."

Councilmember Lewis opened the meeting with an invocation.

Councilmember Lewis then led City Council in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you very much. To start with, just a few brief announcements. First, if there was the unlikely event that we needed to evacuate the building, these are our two exits here in this room, and there is one exit in the room over to my right. Do not use the elevator, if that were to occur, and we have the two stairwells going down, and then use the stairs heading out the front of the building. So, just in the unlikely event we would have to evacuate, please head out the front, and then we would meet. I ask you to meet together in Washington Park afterwards.

A couple of other little announcements, you've seen we've had a little rain today, and it's expected again tomorrow, another downpour. So, we have made a decision that we will not be

holding the West Ashley Farmer's Market tomorrow late afternoon and evening. So, the Farmer's Market in West Ashley will be closed tomorrow, but the weather is supposed to clear up by Friday, and at noon, right out in front facing Broad Street, we'll be opening the Spoleto Festival. I want to welcome everyone to come to the opening and, if you can't make the opening, the City Council and Mayor are having a reception at the Charleston Museum on Friday afternoon from 5:00 p.m. to 7:00 p.m., and it's open to the public. It's our reception honoring the opening of Spoleto and Piccolo Spoleto. The public is welcome to attend.

So, this evening I've got, I think, three proclamations I'd like to share with you. The first is a proclamation regarding June being Alzheimer's and Brain Awareness Month. If Sam Wiley, who is the Vice-President for Programs for the South Carolina Chapter of Alzheimer's Association, would join me. Alzheimer's is a far reaching disease that affects a significant portion of our population, and this month is Alzheimer's Awareness Month. So, I'm going to share with you a proclamation about that."

Mayor Tecklenburg read the proclamation.

---INSERT PROCLAMATION---

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Mr. Wiley."

Sam Wiley said, "I want to thank the Mayor, I want to thank the Councilmembers for this. By recognizing June as Alzheimer's and Brain Awareness Month, you have helped to raise awareness of Alzheimer's disease and its impact on individuals and families nationwide. Everyone who has a brain is at risk to develop Alzheimer's, a fatal disease that is often misunderstood. There are more than 5 million Americans living with Alzheimer's disease, with more than 15 million families and friends serving as Alzheimer's caregivers and care partners. In South Carolina alone, 86,000 people suffer with the disease, and 304,000 provide millions of hours of unpaid care. Alzheimer's disease is more than memory loss, it's a fatal disease, and there are no survivors. It is, as you've heard the Mayor say, the sixth leading cause of death in the United States. It is the only cause of death among the Top Ten diseases that cannot be prevented, cured, or even slowed. Your recognition of our awareness this month will show communities in South Carolina that you understand the struggle of the families that face this, dealing with a diagnosis, and are dedicated to providing the support while we work to find a cure. Thank you again for your recognition, and we're so grateful for this."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, Sam. We appreciate it."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next, I'd like to call Councilmember Seekings to join me and any of the other team members, City members who participated in the annual Dragon Boat Charleston Race. The festival's mission is to promote physical and mental awareness among cancer survivors and throughout the community at large. Do we have a presentation on the screen?"

Councilmember Seekings said, "We've got pictures, Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Okay, we're going to show the pictures. Because of the hard work and generous contributions from 60 participating teams, this year's event raised a grand total of \$189,812. That's pretty good."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, as you can see before us many of our members, we had a City of Charleston team in the Dragon Boat Race. They are known as the Municipal Minions."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg continued, "The Municipal Minions raised almost \$2,000 themselves and took home Second Place, the Silver Medal in their division, as well as an award for the greenest tent. I don't know what that meant, maybe Councilmember Seekings can tell us. Our Silver Medal Team included Jamie Gillette, Steven Julka, Robin Cooper, Jan Park, Councilmember Seekings, Stella Fruit, Kay Cross, Danny Burbage, Laurie Yarbrough, Crystal Reed, Bethany Doman, Janie Borden, Jennifer Ayers-Millar, Susan Poteat, Jonathan Herrin, Nancy Metzler, Michael Metzler, Larry Cross, Paul Wieters, Jackie McKeown, and they were supported by their Landsharks, Susan and Ben Dellucci, Paul Wieters, Keith McKeown, Ty Bailey, and Cheryl O'Donnell. Congratulations to all of you who participated, and here are the pictures. Councilmember Seekings."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Thank you, Mayor Tecklenburg. Thank you, we all have a busy night, but that's okay. So, the City of Charleston Minions and their support team is really an amazing event. I don't know what you know about Dragon Boat Racing, and it is racing. We were out there for a good cause, but I will tell you even though it was a good 'cause, we were out there to win."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Seekings continued, "In any category that we could, we've been doing this for a long time. How many years have we been doing this, team?"

The team said, "Five."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Five years, and this year, in the light of a small craft advisory, hurricane force winds, waves that literally would have taken down the Poseidon, boats sinking all over the Ashley River, the Minions won their heat for the first time ever. We were the first boat to cross the finish line."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Councilmember Seekings continued, "So, racing is only part of it; then, I'll show you these pictures. It's really amazing what we do. As you will see, this is team headquarters right here, and this goes with a lot of hard work, as you will see. We were, by far, the best out there. When you say the 'greenest', Mayor, what that means is we didn't leave anything behind, food, drink, and all that, we consumed all of it. There was nothing left. Here we are, you can't really see the white caps coming over the top, but if Jan Park is here, we literally, in order to get in that boat, we had to bail it that day. It was literally almost impossible. So, it was a ton of fun, and we raised a ton of money, and I'm going to call on Laurie here. We've got a little special award."

Laurie Yarbrough said, "Janie, you want me to do it?"

Councilmember Seekings said, "Or Janie Borden, a little special award that we would like to give two of the big members of our team, but let me just tell you this fellow Councilmembers, if there is ever a part of being a City Councilmember that is really great, it's being part of this team. We've now done it for five years. It's amazing, and what they give back to the community, the City taking a Saturday out, it is unbelievable. So, thank you for letting me be part of that team. I appreciate it."

Ms. Yarbrough said, "Councilmember Seekings is very, very good at what he does on the boat. So, I do want to brag on him for a minute, but we appreciate everyone that helps us, and there are two people that have helped more than their fair share for the last five years. They have gotten food donated, they have cooked food, they have set up, they have lugged tents, they have made minions, they have done it all, and they've done it in the spirit of 'let's do something to make this a special day for cancer survivors.' So, we do a little paddling and have a little fun, but the real workers behind this are Ben and Susan Dellucci, and we need to say thank you to them because they make it happen every year for us. Thank you all, you're awesome."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Ms. Yarbrough said, "I don't know if you know this, but Big Ben goes on Pinterest and finds all of these little projects that he does and makes. So, he's awesome, but we really want to say 'thank you' for their support. So, thank you, guys. Thank you."

Susan Dellucci said, "We don't paddle."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Okay, everybody look at Cameron for a little photo. Tighten up a little bit."

Ms. Dellucci said, "Thank you all for everything."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, next, I would like to ask Mary Coy to join me on the podium. She is the niece of one fine Charlestonian who, unfortunately, we lost this past week. Boy, did he lead a blessed and good long life, Walter Duane, just recently passed at age 96."

Ms. Coy said, "Almost."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Almost 96 years old. So, I have a resolution about our friend, Walter Duane."

Mayor Tecklenburg read the Resolution.

---INSERT RESOLUTION---

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, Mary, this is for you and the family."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg continued, "I knew Walter personally, and he was a real character. When he retired, he would just hang out down at the Charleston Visitor Center. On his own volunteer time, he would be down there greeting visitors who would come to Charleston and tell them these great stories about our City and its people. There is a Gullah dialect, but Walter had what I would call 'Charlestonese' or 'Geechee', and he had it as solid as anybody I'd ever heard. He was an amazing gentleman and representative of our City. I know over the years a lot of things led to us becoming such a tourist destination. I'm convinced one of them is that ole Walter Duane being there at the Visitor's Center, so cordially greeting folks as they would come to our City, a wonderful man."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Mr. Mayor, if I could just add one thing to that. He was a good friend of my father's, they served together in the Knights of Columbus, and when I was involved with the Knights of Columbus, he was always there in support of me in my role. He truly was a true Charlestonian in every sense of the word, a great guy, and truly a treasure for our City."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Well, thank you, and I don't have a proclamation but, in case Council missed it, earlier this week, also a fine and long life, 92-year old Emmett Davis passed away. He was a native, of course, of Greenwood, South Carolina and was a founder of Davis & Floyd. I kind of considered him an honorary Charlestonian. I guess he attended The Citadel years ago. He led a fine life. I've been in touch with his family and expressed our condolences. We do a lot of business with the company. They help us on a lot of our drainage projects and engineering things, and so his son and I ended up talking about that for a little while as well, when I called him up to express my condolences. So, I did apologize and said, 'I didn't really call you to talk about business.' He said, 'Well, John, Emmett would be very disappointed if I didn't at least discuss a little business with you during the phone call.' Anyway, he was great fellow, and I wanted to recognize him as well, Emmett Davis."

We have one public hearing on the agenda tonight. This is an ordinance regarding a small quit-claim deed for a portion of the right-of-way of Fairchild Street. It was actually approved at our Public Works Committee this evening, but we have a public hearing regarding this matter, if anyone would like to be heard."

No one asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "The matter comes before City Council."

Councilmember Waring said, "Move for approval."

Councilmember Williams said, "Second."

On a motion of Councilmember Waring, one (1) bill (Item E-1) received second reading. It passed second reading on motion by Councilmember Williams and third reading on motion of Councilmember Mitchell. On further motion of Councilmember Gregorie, the rules were suspended, and the bill was immediately ratified as:

2017-056 AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO EXECUTE A QUIT-CLAIM DEED FOR A PORTION OF THE RIGHT-OF-WAY ON FAIRCHILD STREET THAT WAS PREVIOUSLY ABANDONED BY CITY COUNCIL AT ITS FEBRUARY 14, 2017 MEETING. THE PROPERTY ABANDONED IS MORE

FULLY SHOWN ON EXHIBIT A, ATTACHED HERETO, AND INCORPORATED BY REFERENCE HEREIN.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next, is the approval of our minutes from the May 9th meeting."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Move for approval."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion to approve. Are there any additions, corrections to be made?"

The Clerk said, "Who was the second? I heard Councilmember Gregorie."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "I did."

The Clerk said, "Thank you."

On a motion of Councilmember Mitchell, seconded by Councilmember Gregorie, City Council voted unanimously to approve the minutes of the May 9, 2017 City Council meeting.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next, is our Citizens Participation Period, and we have 20, 30 folks who are here tonight to speak. So, that's simple enough math, one minute for each speaker, and the Clerk will read them off, although, first up is Mohammed Idris. Mr. Idris."

1. Mohammed Idris said he wanted to bring attention to a couple of great things that took place this weekend. One was when our great President Trump went to the birthplace of democracy, Saudi Arabia, and he told the people that it's not the religion of Judaism, Christianity, or Islam that is the fault of the trouble, it's the crooks in the three religions. He commended what happened in New Orleans with moving the General Lee statue and he hoped for the same outcome with regard to the John C. Calhoun statue on Calhoun Street.
2. Lydia Cotton thanked the Mayor and Council for the Multi-Cultural Center which she said was probably the first Latino Center in the Lowcountry as well as the State. She thanked the Mayor and Mrs. Tecklenburg for making a difference and said it was remarkable to see how families were coming together. She called for everyone in the community regardless of ethnicity to get to work and do more to help the City. She also stated that Chief Mullen has been very gracious to us as well.
3. LuAnn Rosenzweig said she was a member of Kahal Kadosh Beth Elohim Synagogue on Hasell Street and part owner of the Charleston Craft Gallery on Church Street, both of them are in Councilmember White's District. She stated she also serves on the Board of CAJM and asked all of those in support of the Justice Ministry to stand. She said she has been involved with CAJM since it began in 2012, she became involved because she had never seen a group as intentionally diverse that didn't just bring people together to talk about problems but actually acted and produced change. She stated CAJM has been successful in getting the School District to open up almost 300 4-K slots so that no child had to wait on a list, to get access to early childhood education. They have also implemented programs and changed policies that don't criminalize the students, particularly the African American

students, from making the same types of mistakes many of us made in school. She said School Board members attended the Nehemiah Action and enthusiastically declared support for the best practices CAJM identified to improve school, climate, and academic achievement. Finally, the School District recognized there was a serious problem when African American children are suspended six times as often as white students. She questioned why City leaders did not attend the Nehemiah Action. She stated the City of Charleston has yet to acknowledge there is a serious problem when African Americans are twice as likely to be stopped by the Charleston Police as whites. She said until this problem is acknowledged by City leadership and addressed with a serious in-depth audit for racial bias the community will lack trust for the police and City leaders.

4. Deborah Agbor-Tabi said she lived in Councilmember Gregorie's District, was a member of St. James Presbyterian Church in Kathleen Wilson's District, and was a member of CAJM. She said a few years ago she was driving a friend to the ER at the VA Hospital late at night and was stopped at the red light right before you get to the hospital. She said an officer had pulled up behind her and after a few minutes turned on his blue lights and pulled her over where she was already stopped for being a little bit over the white line at the light. She said she couldn't believe that he would pull her over for such a petty reason. Even if it's against the law, she questioned whether that was really a reason to stop someone who was on their way to the hospital and already in distress, or any place for that matter. She was in disbelief, she wasn't shocked. She said this was really a reality for many of her fellow St. James members, and African Americans all across the City. They get pulled over for minor things all the time that accumulate and reinforce the historical reality that they are not treated the same by the police or the City. She said, as a voting, taxpaying citizen, she wants the Council to finally acknowledge that reality and address it properly. Continuing, she said they've provided plenty of research showing Novak Consulting has not done police audits for racial bias in any of the cities they cited and the cities they cited were not comparable to Charleston in size and diversity. She said they asked Mayor Tecklenburg to provide reports of police audits for racial bias that Novak has done in the past, that give him confidence they can do it. To date, they haven't seen any such report. She said if the community doesn't trust the auditing company to produce the transparent report needed to build trust with the police then how can that trust be built?
5. Stephanie Alexander said she was the Senior Rabbi of Kahal Kadosh Beth Elohim Reformed Jewish Synagogue in Councilmember White's District and she lives on James Island in Councilmember Wilson's District. She was also a member and former co-President of CAJM. She stated that for almost two years CAJM has been working on addressing racial discrimination in policing, but the problem has existed for almost 200 years in this Country. They've witnessed so many horrific tragedies resulting from racial discrimination in policing nationally and locally, they thought surely Charleston would use the spotlight shining on this City to become a leader that could set an example for the Nation. It's extremely disappointing that Charleston has not. She said Charleston cannot be a true leader because it's not fulfilling what is known in her faith as Tikkun Olam, the call to repair a broken world, which means, we bear responsibility not only for our own moral, spiritual, and material welfare, but also the welfare of the entire society. She stated this is not a thriving community if many live in fear of those who protect and serve. She said if many in our community don't believe City leaders are seriously concerned about their welfare, or are taking

steps to ensure their wellbeing, and if City leaders won't look to research solutions proposed by those most deeply impacted by a problem in the community, their faith calls upon them to bear witness and to bear responsibility for the entire community, and they've taken action to fulfill that responsibility. She said last fall they submitted hundreds of signatures from community members calling for a qualified audit for racial bias in the police department. This spring they delivered hundreds of more signatures to Mayor Tecklenburg. They gathered thousands of community members and persons to speak with one voice, and they came to many Council meetings sharing stories and researching evidence clearly demonstrating not just the problem but a positive proven solution. She stated it's now upon this City Council to take action. She said they elected them to the very serious responsibility of ensuring the welfare and safety of all citizens, the welfare and safety of police officers, and the citizens they protect and serve. She stated hiring a specialized firm to audit the police department for racial bias will be a significant step in fulfilling that responsibility.

6. Eugene Richardson said he was an elder at St. James Presbyterian Church in Kathleen Wilson's District and stated he has been stopped by the Charleston Police going from his mother's house on James Island to the church on Secessionville Road for driving on the white line. Mr. Richardson said he was sure then and he was sure now he hadn't driven on the white line and when he questioned the officer about it, the officer stated it was alright because he had driven on the white line also many times. The difference is he never gets stopped by the police for doing so. He said for him and many other members of St. James, every time he has been stopped by the Charleston Police he rolled down all of his windows in his truck so that they can see completely see in his vehicle and not treat him as a potential threat. He said every year since CAJM began he has hosted a gathering at his house, where over two dozen St. James and community members shared their worries and fears, and every year almost everyone voiced the same concerns about the police. He stated his duty as an elder and leader in the Justice Ministry and at St. James is an educational one to learn more about the problems that impact him as well as others and play a role in solving them. Continuing, he said they don't just complain; they research best practices and solutions in how they can work here in Charleston. He said they bring them to their elected officials to implement and they let the entire community know where they are, and where their officials stand on those crucial issues. He stated they will never tell anyone how to vote, but they don't have to. He said they make sure they know exactly where all their officials stand in seriously addressing the racism in policing that has been too wrong too long. They look forward to the day they can say all of their City leaders are serious because they have invested in their tax dollars in an audit from a specialized firm that has done audits for racial bias in cities like Charleston before, but they are not hearing that message now.
7. Reverend Nelson asked if the Mayor and Council would accept a copy of the 1834 law that admitted it was legal to educate black people in South Carolina. He quoted Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. and said to the Mayor and other white members of Council had they attended the Nehemiah Action on April 24th, they would have heard what the five black City Councilmembers heard. They would've heard this, Dr. King said, 'A genuine leader is not a searcher for consensus but a molder of consensus.' He stated over the years he has paraphrased these powerful words from Dr. King with his own quote, 'A true leader does not do what is popular and tries to make it right,

but a true leader does what is right and tries to make it popular.' He said it is right to have the police department audited by an independent firm that knows what they're doing and it is right that they would do it. Unfortunately, they have been disappointed again because they find themselves in Charleston. He said the law he just passed out was done by a Charleston lawyer, because a man named Daniel Payne started a school for boys in Charleston. He said he taught the boys science, math, grammar, and the finer arts. He said they went to a plantation and the white doctor and his son found out and they made the law which criminalized education. He stated there had to be people in the General Assembly who knew that was wrong, but it was popular, so it passed. He said they are conflicted now with this issue that you know is wrong, but it's popular, and they would rather do what's wrong because it's popular, as compared to doing what is right, because it is right. That's why it's not acceptable. He quoted another famous African American, Thurgood Marshall, who once was asked, 'How do you define equality, Justice Marshall?' Justice Marshall said, 'Getting the same thing in the same place at the same time.' Reverend Rivers said that doesn't happen for black folk in Charleston and it certainly doesn't happen with the police department. He said, so what do they want? He stated, the same thing in the same place at the same time. He said this was their challenge. He made the point that Justice Marshall made, that he's heard the Mayor say and others say the reason they won't do it is because it's not as serious. You have to do this to protect the citizens because crime is more prevalent in some communities than others. He stated that's only because they don't go through what they go through. He said they have no clue what it feels like to be stopped by the police almost every time when leaving the house. He said they have never been called 'N' word by the police with a gun in your face like he has. He said they've never had the police search them with a gun up against their side threatening to blow them away if they move. He said he has, not in Detroit, not in Mississippi, in Charleston, West Ashley, Downtown, Rutledge Avenue, we know that, and what they're really saying to us is that it's not bad enough for us to handle it for them and that is wrong. He stated they shouldn't have to wait until they feel it, they should know it because they said it and that's disrespectful. He stated to the Mayor finally his disappointment is also because he watched the Mayor run, he heard what the Mayor said, he watched him sing in their churches and play the piano in the sanctuary and this is not about how well the Mayor plays and sings. The Mayor told everyone and him that he would stand for justice and it's now time to do what the Mayor said and stand for justice. Make sure the police department is audited with an independent audit so that the change can come. He said, as long as it takes they'll be back over and over and over again.

The Clerk said, "Okay, that's the end of the list."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you very much. Petitions and Communications."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Moody said, "I was not going to say anything, but I feel compelled for those behind me. I don't see any on this side, but my name is Bill Moody. I represent District 11, and I'm also a member of John Wesley United Methodist Church. I've been a member since December 1968, and my faith tells me that I need to love my neighbor, love my fellow man. I don't hold any animosity to these people that come and speak, but I do believe that I have been disrespected. Because I didn't attend the Nehemiah dinner or event, I am held out as a racist or something like that. What I will tell you was that I took the call from the leaders of this

organization and I, by myself, went and met with seven of these members one afternoon at Cherokee United Methodist Church. I was with them for an hour and a half discussing their concerns and why I didn't attend those meetings that they wanted me to attend. What I told them at the time was, that I can't fix generalities. I can't fix all of the problems in the world. I said if you will give me a specific instance where things happened, because I know we're not perfect, I know we make mistakes, but if you will give me a specific incident, I will look into it. The lady that was there gave me two, one that occurred at the airport and one that occurred out on Johns Island. I told her that both of those were not in the City of Charleston, and I didn't have any way of addressing those items.

Then, I made the comment to them that let's just assume that all 2,000 of their incidents are correct, that our police force was wrong, and that they had no cause for what they did. So, we have an audit, we spend a lot of money to have a company come in here and audit our police force, and tell us 'you did wrong.' Okay, I said, 'give us all that', we did wrong in all those cases, which I don't think we did, but I said I'll give that to you. Now, what do we do? How do we fix this? What are we supposed to do as a City? My answer to that is we've done a couple of things. Number one, long before that, we had started this Illumination Project to try to build trust. So, in order to build the trust between the black and the white community and any other community between the police force and the citizens, we need to have a high level of trust. Chief Mullen and the police department, along with Mayor Riley and now Mayor Tecklenburg, have led that issue to build that trust. We were given tonight a sheet. I didn't know this was coming, but there is actually a process for filing complaints. We can work on specific items. We can't work on injustice, it's everywhere. If you want to start comparing injustice, I know that there is black and white, and being black is different, and I understand that and I appreciate that. Also, everybody's got a problem, and we can't fix all that, but we can fix individual things. So, I'm not asking for any kind of commitment from anybody tonight. I just felt like these people have been coming for three meetings, making their case, and nobody's spoken, to give maybe another side of the story. I think there is another side of the story, and I think our City is working on some of these items. I just wanted to get that out there, and I'll be glad to meet with these folks. I'm not going to stand up in a public meeting and be ridiculed by them. I don't intend to do that, but if somebody wants to meet one-on-one, I'm glad to meet with them. I just wanted to make that comment, Mr. Mayor, and maybe we ought to look at how we're doing this 30 minutes that we're spending our time on here. I'm not sure that we ought to allow one organization to get up if somebody's going to sign up and give their time away, I would like to hear what they have to say and not some kind of orchestrated assault on City Council. I just don't think it's right. We've got 30 minutes, that's all we've got. I'd like to hear from all of the citizens, and I'd like to hear those individuals. Just because they sign up and they don't speak, maybe they should be allowed to speak for a while. So, it's something to think about. Thank you, Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Mitchell.

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Yes, Mr. Mayor, and my colleagues, I heard my colleague speaking, but the things that we, as African Americans, went through in this City, I don't think my colleague can realize, not even myself. In the '60s, I was 14 years old. I was locked up 25 times trying to make a difference right here in this community, at that time, 14 years old back in the '60s, demonstrating and trying to make a difference bringing people together. As of today, it's still not there. I'm out in the street more so than most of the Councilmembers because of the district I represent. I see all of the challenges that have happened.

I was stopped for a license plate bulb that they said was out, and it was not out.

Councilmember Lewis was with me. I had just left the neighborhood association meeting on Sumter Street. The officer followed me from Burke High School across Ashley Avenue, across Rutledge Avenue, and didn't stop me until we crossed Perry Street. If he wanted to stop me, why didn't he stop me way back there? So, when the cop came up to me, I said, 'Officer, do you have a problem?' Then Councilmember Lewis said, 'They know who I am.' We need to end the foolishness, if I know I'm right, I'm going to say what I have to say. So, he came up and said, 'No', and he had his bright light shining on me. I said, 'Well, excuse me, just turn your bright light off, and you will see the light is on'. He said, 'oh, yes, your light is working, it looks kind of dim.' I said, 'That's factory made, and that's the way it's going to be.' I said, 'Now, you have a good day', and I got in my car, and I drove off. Then, again, by an officer, I was stopped again in the City, and I have 'Municipal Council' on my tags, and it doesn't make any difference to anyone. They saw me. Councilmember Lewis was stooping down in the car like this, and that's why I was stopped. Sociology was my major, and I know from counseling, living in New York, being on the streets of New York, I know how it is. So, in this community, I have seen this many times. Come on the Eastside, and see how many times it is happening. If we have a fine police department, and if there's not a problem, what are we worrying about?

So, these are the things I'm looking at very seriously. We're looking at it this evening with CAJM. I had a problem one time with them. I didn't go to one of the meetings myself, but when I looked at it, I see what's happening in the community. If we do not have a problem, if we've got the best police department in the world, then what are we afraid of? This is all I'm saying. If we have something we need to do, we know it's nationwide. It's not only happening here in Charleston, in Charlotte, it's this place, that place. There's a problem here, and we just need to fix it. As for the Illumination Project, I work with them too. I have it in my church. The two people who worked on it are members of my church, Bob and Margaret Seidler. They are members of my church, and we work together a lot. I worked with Chief Mullen with that, too, but I'm saying that if this is what it's going to take, we need to go and put it to rest, R-E-S-T. Put it to rest, and get it over with instead of having them come to this meeting all of the time. People are looking at us and saying, 'What's wrong with the City of Charleston?' This is supposed to be the best city in the world. We are a leading city. These are the things I'm looking at, and it bothers me because I'm out there. Come out in the street with me at 1:00 a.m. or 2:00 a.m. in the morning. I'm out there.

This is what I'm saying, if we need to do it, do it, and get it over with and put it to rest. Then we won't have them coming and sitting here in City Council for Citizens Participation. That's what I'm saying. I went to the meeting. We went to the meeting. Sure, we stood there. We know it has to go through a process. When I went there, you still have to go through a process, but all I can do is give my opinion on it, and you're going to give your opinion on it. I feel like each one of us here has to do something, do it, and get it over with, as far as the organization is concerned. You might disagree, but then you're not out there with me. You do not have to be out in the community as I have to be out there. We grew up differently. What I have to take, you don't have to take, and I can tell you that wholeheartedly. That's a fact. I'm not disrespecting anyone, but that's a fact. For my sons and kids, I can tell you things that happened to them, too, and it wasn't nice. Especially for my two boys, it wasn't nice. That's why one of my sons moved away from here, and guess where he's living at now, in Alabama. He has problems there, but there he holds his own, and he has three kids graduating, three young girls graduating. One child is coming out of school with five full scholarships to five different universities and doesn't have to pay a cent. I taught him, and he's holding his own right there in Alabama. He moved away from Charleston because of the same thing. My oldest son, every time they looked around, they stopped him and pulled him over. He said, 'Daddy, why are they stopping me all of the time', because I'm walking the street. I live on King Street,

and they've stopped me on King Street right down the street from my house. 'What are you doing on King Street?' I grew up here in the City of Charleston right here. So, I've seen things differently than you, Councilmember, and I have gone through different challenges than you have to go through. So, it's a little different. We work together, we play together, but when that light goes out and that sun goes down, you are up there, and I'm here. That's the way it was, and that's the way the City of Charleston is."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Lewis.

Councilmember Lewis said, "Mr. Mayor, I'm going to say this, and I'm going to say this to several Councilmembers sitting around this table. About three years ago, you've been here two years now, Councilmember Mitchell stood at Burke School and watched a police officer take a kid, and throw the kid against the counter. He filed a report with Internal Affairs, nothing happened. He came in and talked to City Council about it, and nothing happened. So, it seems like if a Councilmember says something, they must be lying. Our friend here is telling the truth. We have a problem. Let's do the audit, and get it over with. If the audit says we have a problem, or problems, let's work on them. If the audit says there's no problem, that's fine, but we've got a lot of business to take care of, and this is going on over and over and over, the same thing. But, we were told we had an auditor. They brought the information about the auditor, saying that we had an auditor in the City qualified to do the work on racial bias. If the money is in the budget to do it, do it. If it's not in the budget, then the Mayor and City Council can say, 'We are not going to do it.' One way or the other, let's get this behind us."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you very much."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Waring said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. Bill Moody is not a racist. Nobody around this table is. We are very pleased to serve on a Council with people of integrity. I don't think if you go back in the history of Council you could always say that about all twelve, but I can say that about all of the twelve people that we serve on this Council with. What we have here and, Bill, what you're looking for, I don't want to put words in your mouth, is you're looking for a solution to a problem. What our City has done is we've hired a firm to do an audit, and correct me if I'm wrong, that doesn't have the experience to do that and you know what, our Council didn't know that. I didn't know it. I thought we were hiring a firm to work on the efficiencies from one department to the other, and that's what I voted for, Mr. Mayor. This firm, Novak, does not have that experience, and we will not get that solution. In the area that we live in, the reason North Charleston is working on this right now is because an African American man got murdered by being shot in the back. That's why. Why do we have to have a tragedy to work towards best practices? Now, I've said that in front of CAJM. I think Chief Mullen is one of the finest Chiefs in America, I've said it. I think we have one of the finest police departments in America. Do we have problems? The numbers and the data dictate we do. What we have going on here is we've been lobbied as a Council because of the tactics or the approach that CAJM has when they approach us individually as Councilmembers. We don't like to be, and I'm going to use a term that I've heard before, not from you, but I've heard it, Bill, from others, ganged up on. These people aren't criminals. Look at them. These are, as we say, the salt of the earth. We had the Rabbi here just speaking, and I couldn't believe we were going to muffle the Rabbi. The process that we have in place is wrong.

Now, there's a way we can fix that. If you were to look at how we went about selecting that firm, I've had an issue, and we've talked about it at the water cooler about how we go about

doing the RFP or the RFQ process. Look at how we went about selecting Novak. Look at the results we've gotten. When I sat and I spoke with Novak, Councilmember Gregorie was there, Councilmember White was there with me, when I opened up the brochure that they were proud to show and showed the staff of Novak, I found nobody that looked like me, Councilmember Lewis, Councilmember Mitchell, Councilmember Gregorie, or Councilmember Williams. In a City as diverse as Charleston, South Carolina, that's wrong. That's just wrong. So, as a Councilperson, how do we do something about that? We have a RFP, and we go out and find firms that are qualified to do it. Do I think we'll find something that we can correct? I would much like to do it that way as opposed to doing it under a tragedy, and I'll give an example. Was it on John Street not too long ago where a situation occurred where they pulled away from the police officer, and the police officer shot at him? The only reason that CNN trucks weren't there and satellites going someplace else across the country is because he missed. He missed. We don't need a tragedy for somebody to tell us, 'hey, let's get qualified people to do these audits.' Now, the way we can do something about that, this is not an agenda item, of course, we could put that on the agenda, but to put it on the agenda tonight, we need two-thirds of the vote to request Council and the City to go out and hire a firm that has the qualifications and the track record to do this type of audit. Now, if that motion is put on the floor tonight, do we have two-thirds to put it on the floor, or do we want to have a week or so to think about it? We can put it on the agenda, but Novak is not that firm."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Moody said, "I wanted to defend a little bit our procurement process because I agree with you, Keith (Councilmember Waring), in my mind, when we were doing those efficiency requests at the time, at least in my interviews, I said, 'let's put the fire department and the police department off because we've got some issues going on that we're working on.' I'm not sure how, I thought we had selected this firm to do certain things, and then we kind of added this thing. I don't disagree with what you're saying. This may not be the right firm to do it, but I don't even think they were part of the original request. I think that was added, was it not, Mayor?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "It was part of the original request."

Councilmember Moody said, "It was to include that part of it."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, sir."

Councilmember Moody said, "Okay, well, then, I stand corrected on that. I thought that we were selecting and doing some other things first and maybe not looking at the police department first. I thought we had these other projects we were focusing on."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "It was part of the request for a proposal that the auditing firm be able to do a bias based audit of our police department. It was part of the original request."

Councilmember Moody said, "Okay, I didn't remember that. Okay."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregorie.

Councilmember Gregorie said, "My problem, Mayor, is I have no problem with the assessment. I do have a fundamental problem with Novak because, again, when we were being debriefed, and we opened their brochures, and I'm talking about maybe 30 people, not

three or four, there was not one person that looked like me. That's a problem for me. The other thing is, and I think that our Chief is one of the best Chiefs there is. I have a lot of respect for him, but I have a problem with the fox watching the hen house, and by that I mean the Chief is a staff person over the assessment, an assessment that includes his department. Now, if there is a bias feature that's a part of the effort of Novak, I have a problem with the Chief being the head of that. I think we need, and you and I have had this conversation, and I've had this conversation with the Chief, I truly feel that that is something that should be in our Human Resources Department. Now, perhaps, there are some capacity issues there, I don't know. I don't know why the Chief is heading this assessment, but for me that's problematic, particularly if we're assessing his department, and I'm not saying that the Chief is going to do anything wrong, and that he can't be objective. For me, it's the appearance. It's all about appearance. So, I think that we should hire an independent audit of our police department, I do. Some would argue 'let's wait until we complete the performance assessment.' It makes sense, but, again, who is overseeing the effort? I think the fact that the Chief is overseeing this effort, at least for me, is problematic, and regardless of how well this assessment is, that cloud will always exist. So, I really think that we need to look at how we're conducting this assessment. I know you're ultimately responsible, but I still think that the appearance is problematic for me, and I'm sure at some point for others. The results could be glowing, the results could be perfect, that everything is good, but again, you're going to have that cloud, Mayor, because of who is heading it, the staff person that's heading it, and I just wanted that to become a part of the record."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Thank you very much. If there are no further comments on that matter, next is our Petitions and Communications."

Councilmember Waring said, "Wait a minute, Mr. Mayor, wait a minute. That's just not a casual discussion. Are you satisfied with the firm and their experience in conducting police audits with racial bias? Are you satisfied with Novak?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Well, Councilmember Waring, the request for proposal, as was asked by Councilmember Moody, included among other things, including a general performance assessment as needed department by department, a specific request to be able to conduct a review and assessment audit, whatever you want to call it, of bias within our police department. It called for that specifically."

Councilmember Waring said, "Councilmembers didn't know that when they voted on it. I didn't know. Bill, did you know?"

Councilmember Gregorie said, "I didn't."

Councilmember Waring said, "Did you?"

Councilmember Gregorie said, "No."

Councilmember Waring said, "How many Councilmembers around this table knew that? Did you know Councilmember Wilson?"

Councilmember Wilson said, "No, I didn't."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I'm not sure why you didn't know it."

Councilmember Waring said, "Because it was buried in the proposal, that's where it was."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "No, sir."

Councilmember Waring said, "It was buried in the proposal. Well, if the majority of Council didn't know they were voting on an aspect that included racial bias, quite frankly, Mr. Mayor, that's a sham. That should have been done separately, and if you're going to have an audit done, you cannot choose your auditor. The Chief cannot participate in choosing a firm that's going to audit the police department. Bill, you did audits all of your life. How many firms chose you to do the audit to audit themselves for an independent audit?"

Councilmember Moody said, "I agree. Can you take the Chief's name off of it and just use the position?"

Councilmember Waring said, "Correct."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Now, so, Councilmember Waring, the firm is hired to address any department in the City. So, we just organizationally had Chief Mullen and members of our Finance Department kind of heading up this performance innovation project, all reporting to the Mayor and at the pleasure of City Council. So, are you saying that they're not able to look at any department where any department member was involved in either the selection or the review process?"

Councilmember Waring said, "What I am saying, Mr. Mayor, as a Councilperson that voted to hire Novak to look at the efficiencies of our various departments, I was fine with that. When I found out that Novak was the firm, number one when I found out that the City was actually doing a racial bias audit of our police department, I didn't know it. I would like to be able to vote on that separately. I don't think it should be buried down in a proposal, and I don't think Council should find that out after the fact, and, frankly, I do believe the majority of Council found that out after the fact. So, now, if you want, we could take a show of hands to see who all knew that when we were voting on it, but I know I didn't know it, and I feel confident that four of the five African Americans. I haven't asked Councilmember Williams, maybe he knew, but a goodly amount of Council did not know. If we're going to hire a firm as a City to conduct such an audit, I think that should be separate and stand alone. Let's have the RFP, and let's get firms that have the qualifications and a track record that have done so. That's what I'm saying. I don't think your Council knew that. I don't know, are you satisfied with Novak conducting this audit? I guess I'm sure you're going to give an affirmative of that, but I'd like to know the experience of them doing that. When I look at that firm, when I look at their brochure that they proudly display, it wreaks of a lack of confidence in that regard for me."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Well, thank you. Councilmember Seekings, who was on the review committee, if I may ask? I forget."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Seekings.

Councilmember Seekings said, "Just very briefly, in terms of the process of the process, just so everyone in this room knows how we got to Novak. Before they were hired, we had meetings with the team that was assigned by you, Mayor, to vet and put out the RFP. Every Councilmember had an opportunity to talk to that team in advance of the RFP going out and everyone being hired. So, we got to do that, and then after Novak was hired, we've all been

invited to meet with Novak. So, just in terms of the process of the process, we have not been kept in the dark."

Councilmember Waring said, "I don't know what team you're talking about because I wasn't a part of that team."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "I don't either."

Councilmember Seekings said, "I recall very distinctly sitting in an office with Chief Mullen and with Ms. Wharton and who else was there, Amy?"

Ms. Wharton said, "Susan Poteat."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Right, Susan Poteat, in advance of this RFP and Novak being signed on to talk about what the scope of their work would be. We all had that opportunity. I know I did, I don't know if anybody else availed themselves of it."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I'm surprised to hear this, Councilmember Waring, because there was a lot of scrutiny about this issue based upon the issue being raised by our friends with CAJM who are here this evening and almost all of the meetings we had."

Councilmember Waring said, "Let's narrow this down to the firm to be selected to conduct the racial bias of our police department, to do that study, to do that audit. Is that what you're talking about?"

Councilmember Seekings said, "Yes."

Councilmember Waring said, "No, we didn't have that. No, sir. I didn't have that."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Well, I remember being in a room with a Councilmember, I don't want to put him on the spot, he can speak for himself, but there were other Councilmembers there."

Councilmember Waring said, "Who were the other Councilmembers? Let's have it out."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Well, I know who I was there with, I was there with Councilmember Shahid, Ms. Wharton, the Chief, and --."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "How were you informed? How were you informed of the meeting? I didn't know about the meeting."

Councilmember Shahid said, "I'd have to go back and look, but I do remember we were all invited to sit down and meet in advance of this RFP because we've had some issues with RFPs coming before the Council before we had a chance to talk about it, and specifically, the West Ashley Commission, if you recall."

Councilmember Waring said, "I still have a problem with that one."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Right, but, so, there was an attempt to get out in advance of this to talk with the team that was assigned by you, Mr. Mayor, to do all of this."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We followed our normal process."

Councilmember Waring said, "No, I heard two Councilmembers."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, sir."

Councilmember Waring said, "One, two, the Chief, and Ms. Wharton. Bill, Councilmember Wilson, did you have such an audience for racial bias to sit down with this team that Councilmember Seekings just referred to? This is part of the problem. Well, I just asked Bill a question, though. Did you have that opportunity? We want to move on past this. This is affecting our community. There's nothing like being in the car with your wife, being stopped, and you know you didn't do anything wrong. Now, I'm not talking in the abstract. That happened to me. It's nothing like being a grandfather, going through all of this process we've gone through from segregation to integration, and you know you've got to act a certain way, or you're going to be jacked up. While I was stopped, I was wondering what happens if I were 21, or 25, filled up with testosterone, instead of being 59, 60. You say, 'yes, sir', you say, 'yes, ma'am', you get the officer's name, you act accordingly, and you get let go. You get let go from something that you should have never been stopped for to begin with. How often does that happen to you, Mr. Mayor, and your wife? Prior to being Mayor, how often did that happen to you?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Well, I will share with you that I would have stood up at the CAJM meeting when the question was asked about instructing your children. I was brought up in respect for whatever situation might occur to a police officer, that when you get pulled I was, I forgot who taught me, it wasn't my Daddy, but that a safe thing to do is to put your hands on the steering wheel and allow the officer to see your hands and that you're not about to do something unsafe or challenging to him. I had that discussion with my children when they got their driver's license and learned to drive. Maybe I'm an exception to the rule but, for me, I did that."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Lewis.

Councilmember Lewis said, "Mr. Mayor, so that we can move on with business, I would respectfully request that we put this item on the agenda, that we hire an audit firm to do racial bias on the police department. If it's the wish of Council, we will vote this up and down in the June meeting, if you would put this request or proposal on the agenda at the June meeting, and that's a motion."

Councilmember Waring said, "I'll second it."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion on the floor."

Councilmember Waring said, "I'm just talking about putting it on the June agenda."

Mayor Tecklenburg continued, "As you mentioned earlier, a majority vote in order to change the agenda."

Councilmember Waring said, "We're not changing this agenda."

Councilmember Lewis said, "We are not changing the agenda, Mr. Mayor. We are putting it on the agenda for June. We are asking that it be placed on the June agenda, so it

would give you and your staff time to look at it and think about it. It would be the June agenda."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Oh, I see."

Councilmember Waring said, "I withdraw the second. We don't need a motion for that to put it on the agenda."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "No, we don't. We don't need a motion for that."

Councilmember Lewis said, "I want to make sure that they put it on the agenda."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "We just requested it. It should be."

Councilmember Lewis said, "Okay."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have to do that. Alright. Thank you."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Mr. Mayor, I just want to clarify one point."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Shahid.

Councilmember Shahid said, "There was a meeting, I'm looking at my calendar, on February 9th, and I didn't set this meeting. I was called to this meeting. I believe Councilmember Williams was present, Councilmember Seekings, and myself. We met with members of the finance office at the Chief's office, where it took place. I remember it well because it took place before we had our workshop on the BAR Ordinance. The purpose of this meeting was just to talk, and my assumption at the time, I may be just totally wrong on this, was that there were other members who weren't either invited to this meeting. It was just to give us an overview of the audit, and I think we used the word 'performance' audit at the time. There was nothing more about it that was sort of who these folks were, what their qualifications were. I didn't know who else had been invited or had not been invited to the meeting. I didn't know if there was a series of these meetings taking place. That was sort of my impression of it, at the time, that this was being opened up to other folks to participate and understand who these auditors were. I met with them again, we had a second meeting, I think, at our Public Safety meeting we had once, and the Chief can correct me on that, but they came again to sort of give us an overview as to what this audit was that was going to take place. I just want the record to be clear that that was what took place back on February 9th, and it took place a second time. I think it was publicized about that, that second meeting with the Novak Group. Let's put this on the agenda for the June meeting. Let's talk about this again. I have a lot I want to contribute to this, but I think that this is not the time right now to do it. This is part of our Citizens Participation Period, but this is a serious issue, a critical issue, that we all need to take ownership of and responsibility of, and I think that's good that we're having a debate about it. I'm glad we're talking about it. Let's put it on the agenda, but I just wanted to make that point clear since it came up earlier about that meeting on February 9th."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, Councilmember Shahid."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregorie.

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Yes, Mr. Mayor, I stand corrected. I do recall a meeting with the Novak representatives. The Chief, Amy was there, and I think a couple of other people

were there, where we did discuss the scope of the assessment and whether or not there were any issues that we wanted included. So, I stand corrected, however, there was never ever any discussion with regard to the assessment including racial bias, at least not in the meeting that I attended. I apologize, I did attend a meeting, and I think that they met with the Councilmembers in smaller groups. I was there with Councilmember White. I think it was Councilmember White and I. So, I stand corrected, I did attend the meeting."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you. Alright. Now, to our Petitions and Communications. Our Boards and Commissions appointments were deferred until next month. I did want to introduce to Council a new member of our staff, and that's an intern here for the summer. He's a student at Winthrop University, and he's working in the Mayor's office, Thomas Simmons. Thomas, would you stand and be recognized?"

There was applause in the Chamber.

Councilmember Shahid said, "Mr. Mayor, he is a proud graduate of Porter Gaud School."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "A native of James Island."

Councilmember Waring said, "Thomas is a super Sophomore at Winthrop University. He's being a little modest over there."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Council, I would also like to make a brief report to you about a meeting that I attended, along with Councilmembers Gregorie and Wilson, of the James Island Intergovernmental Council, I think they call it. This was a follow-up to our approval, at our last meeting, for a six-month moratorium on large new projects on James Island in the City of Charleston. So, we promised Council we'd work with the other jurisdictions and, in fact, we met with the Intergovernmental Council, and they passed a resolution that I wanted to share with you, that called on really the other jurisdictions. I know this may not be too interesting, but if I could have your attention, I'd appreciate it. We called on the other jurisdictions, being Charleston County, the Town of James Island, and the City of Folly Beach, to also follow our lead and impose a six-month moratorium on new zoning permits and non-residential zoning districts. We also proposed to create, it won't, I don't believe, and called for an action of Council at this point, but it was resolved that the four jurisdictions would create a joint James Island Planning Committee. We would appoint one of our staff members to represent the City of Charleston on that joint committee. Our Planning Director, Jacob Lindsey, has volunteered to serve in that capacity. This Planning Committee would help to draft, develop a comprehensive plan for James Island that we will come back to Council with, once that's done. I must say, at my amendment to the motion, we included consideration of the following categories to be part of this plan, and that is: affordable housing; where the urban growth boundary is or isn't, depending on what jurisdiction you are; to have a joint Design Review Board amongst the jurisdictions, which, I think, would be an incredible collaborative effort; to include consideration of drainage improvements; and to start with the Folly Road Overlay District that was proposed. I think it was proposed about three or four years ago, but the City had rejected it. Anyway, those are some of the considerations that would go into this planning effort. So, we're going to proceed with that. Jacob is going to be our representative, and they should be meeting soon, and we'll be coming back to you with more information as they continue to meet. Are there any questions or comments?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Waring followed by Councilmember Shahid.

Councilmember Waring said, "Mr. Mayor, I guess when this issue goes up in front of County Council, are we going to send a resolution or anything asking for support of the six-month moratorium on James Island? My understanding is that's going to go in front of County Council soon."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "My understanding is, they should have gotten a copy of this resolution from the Intergovernmental Council. So, I think we're covered there."

Councilmember Shahid said, "As part of the efforts that we're taking with the coordination of all of this, Mr. Mayor, but it shouldn't just be confined to James Island, even though James Island is unique with the different entities that are involved, the Town, the County, the PSD, and the City. Those of us who represent parts of West Ashley, and I don't want to speak for my fellow Councilmembers, but we sort of experience the same kind of problems on a smaller scale because we have a public service district. We have the County, and we have the City, and the most glaring example of that was that mini-storage facility on St. Andrews Boulevard. It was kind of within the County and outside of our jurisdiction. So, hopefully, what the experience may be with this James Island experiment is that we can probably learn from that, and maybe see what came out of our planned West Ashley project and have this type of coordination for unincorporated areas of West Ashley, as well. It's an ongoing problem. It's a serious problem of how our entities are not communicating with one another on these sort of things. I applaud what you've done, thank you for what you've done, and you might want to carry it over maybe into West Ashley."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you. Alright. We're going to move on to our Council Committee Reports. First on Recreation, Councilmember Gregorie."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Yes, Mr. Mayor and Council, the Recreation Committee met on Tuesday the 16th at 3:00 p.m. While I know it appears as though our agenda is jam-packed, it's like that because what we do is we leave items on the agenda until they're completed. The first item on our agenda, and I won't go through all of them, by the way, there are three items that we have to vote on, it's not just information. The Bender Street Park Project is in progress. The WPAL Park, we will be seeking funds for that once the half-cent sales tax dollars grants are due. The Lenevar Playground replacement is on schedule. The plaques for Mother Emanuel should be here this week, and our Parks Department is currently working on several of our park buildings. The MOJA Festival and the Spoleto Festival all seem to be doing well. The Natatorium, we didn't have a report, however, we will have a report at our next meeting on some financing possibilities. The first item that we voted on had to do with employee discounts at the Municipal Golf Course, and that was just simply to make sure that those discounts are consistent with employee discounts for other recreational facilities. We talked about a Hall of Fame, and we also voted unanimously to name the multi-purpose room at the Arthur Christopher Community Center after Marchitta Frayer known, as 'Ms. Tee'. She recently passed and dedicated much of her life to that facility and our Recreation Department. There are family members here of Mrs. Frayer, and I'd like for them to stand and be recognized. Her son is here, Nathan. I'd really like to take this opportunity, Mr. Mayor, to first thank the family for being here and to also thank the family for sharing their mother with us, who has done an unbelievable job in dedicating her service to the communities of Charleston. So, thank you for being here."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Councilmember Gregorie continued, "Later on in the summer, we will do a formal dedication and make sure that you're part of the planning of that. The last thing on our agenda is separating the Arts and History Commission into two separate Commissions, which, to me, is key in making sure that our Art Commission is not just focused on the relics of the City. We now have an Arts Commission that would be all inclusive of all the arts in the City. So, I think it's a great thing for making that separation. Our Committee voted unanimously on those three items, and I recommend that we approve."

Councilmember Williams said, "Move for approval."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion and a second, is there any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

The Clerk said, "Okay, so, the naming of the room for 'Ms. Tee' in the Arthur Christopher Gym and the separation of the ordinance. So, when you say three, you're talking about Arts and History."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "No."

The Clerk said, "Okay, what's the third item?"

Councilmember Gregorie said, "I'm also talking about the employee discount."

The Clerk said, "Employee discount."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Right."

The Clerk said, "Thanks."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "A motion to approve an employee discount at the Municipal Golf Course, the naming of the multi-purpose room after 'Ms. Tee', and the ordinance to separate what was the Arts and History Commission into two separate Commissions, one for Arts, one for History."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a second, is there any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Williams, seconded by Councilmember Mitchell, City Council voted unanimously to adopt the Committee on Recreation Report as presented:

---INSERT RECREATION REPORT---

a. Parks Improvement and Expansion (INFORMATION ONLY)

-- Status of Improvements to:

- a) Bender Street Park
- b) WPAL Park

-- Update on Lenevar Playground Replacement

- Update on plaques for the Mother Emanuel commemoration
- Report on condition of Park buildings in general and schedule for repairs
- Restrooms for Ferguson Village
- b. Cultural Services – Cultural Plan (INFORMATION ONLY)
 - Update on Spoleto and MOJA Festivals
- c. Recreation Department and facilities
 - Natatorium update (Information Only)
 - Employee discounts at Municipal Golf Course (Information Only)
 - Draft program for creating a Hall of Fame for Parks and Recreation contributions (Information Only)
 - Naming of the multipurpose room after Marchitta Frayer (“Ms. Tee”)
- d. An ordinance to amend the Code of the City of Charleston, South Carolina, Chapter 2, Article IV, to separate the Arts and History Commission into two separate commissions, and to provide for the membership, the terms of office and the powers for each commission.

First reading was given to the following bill:

An ordinance to amend the Code of the City of Charleston, South Carolina, Chapter 2, Article IV, to separate the Arts and History Commission into two separate commissions, and to provide for the membership, the terms of office and the powers for each commission.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Thank you, Councilmember Gregorie. Thank you, family, for being with us and again, for the beautiful life of your Mom, and what she did for so many kids in our City. It’s just remarkable. The Committee on Community Development, Councilmember Mitchell.”

Councilmember Seekings said, “Move for adoption of the report of the MOU.”

Councilmember Gregorie said, “Second.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Alright. Is there any discussion?”

On a motion of Councilmember Seekings, seconded by Councilmember Gregorie, City Council voted unanimously to adopt the Committee on Community Development Report as presented:

---INSERT COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT REPORT---

- a. Approval of a Memorandum of Understanding from Sky Garden Developers

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Committee on Traffic and Transportation.”

Councilmember Gregorie said, “Move for approval.”

Councilmember Seekings said, “Second.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Is there any discussion?”

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Gregorie, seconded by Councilmember Seekings, City Council voted unanimously to adopt the Committee on Traffic and Transportation Report as presented:

---INSERT TRAFFIC AND TRANSPORTATION REPORT---

- a. Application for Original Certificate of Public Convenience and Necessity:
 - Moe Express Transportation LLC (Taxi)
- b. Approval of 2017-2018 Vendor Spaces
- c. Approval of 2017-2018 Bid Specifications for Street Vendor Spaces
- d. Approval of 2017-2018 Franchise Agreement for Vendor Spaces
- e. Bike and Pedestrian Committee Discussion (INFORMATION ONLY)

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Committee on Public Works and Utilities."

Councilmember Williams said, "Yes, move for approval. Mr. Mayor, Item 4(b) was deferred, the MUSC item was deferred. Everything else was approved."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Seekings.

Councilmember Seekings said, "Can I just ask a quick question on Item 4(b), which is the approval of the Memorandum Agreement between the City and MUSC on Doughty Street? Where is that? Is that coming one of these days?"

Councilmember Williams said, "We brought that up in committee earlier today. They are still in discussions. There are a few things they've got to work out. So, it's still in discussions. It's still going to happen, but it's still under discussion."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We were real close."

Councilmember Williams said, "Very close."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, I'm not even sure what little item hung it up at this point, but the main thing was that Roper still needs to be able to get their parking garage."

Councilmember Williams said, "Mayor, I also would like to add that we will have the contract agreement for the Church Creek Drainage Study. We'll have that next time."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Great."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Okay, is there any other discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

The Clerk said, "We have a motion. Yes, we have a motion, Councilmember Williams and Councilmember Seekings, Public Works and Utilities. Okay, you can carry the vote."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Okay, we're good on that. We lost our Chairman on Ways and Means."

The Clerk said, "Well, I think you need to vote. I don't think the vote was complete. There was a question."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, I thought it was."

Councilmember Shahid said, "No, we did not vote."

The Clerk said, "No, we did not vote. In the middle, Jennifer asked if we had the motion, and we did have the motion. So, now we need to vote."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Okay, maybe we're voting again, but we'll do it. This is a motion to approve the Committee on Public Works and Utilities Report."

On a motion of Councilmember Williams, seconded by Councilmember Seekings, City Council voted unanimously to adopt the Committee on Public Works and Utilities Report as presented:

---INSERT PUBLIC WORKS AND UTILITIES REPORT---

a. Acceptance and Dedication of Rights-of-Way and Easements:

- Carolina Bay Phase 21B - Acceptance and dedication of Doubletree Court (50-foot right-of-way [1,311 LF]), Willet Way (50-foot right-of-way [231 LF]), a portion of Conservancy Lane (50-foot right-of-way [1,018 LF]), and a portion of Bethel Way (50-foot right-of-way [285 LF]). There are 64 lots. All infrastructure except sidewalks (bonded) are complete.

- a. Title to Real Estate
- b. Affidavit for Taxable or Exempt Transfers
- c. Plat
- d. Exclusive Storm Water Drainage Easements

**b. Approval of a Memorandum of Agreement by and between the City of Charleston and MUSC regarding Doughty Street and the Medical District Project.
(DEFERRED)**

c. Close and Abandon a Portion of Fairchild Street

-- Close and abandon a portion of Fairchild Street, Daniel Island, County of Berkeley designated as "RCP 1, 4,899 sq. ft., 0.112 acres conveyed to Parcel 1" on the plat entitled "A Final Subdivision and Property Line Adjustment Plat of

TMS 275-00-00-260 – Daniel Island, Fairchild Street, owned by DIEC II, LLC, Located in the City of Charleston, Berkeley County, South Carolina”.

-- Close and abandon a portion of Fairchild Street, Daniel Island, County of Berkeley designated as “RCP 3, 111 sq. ft., 0.003 acres conveyed to Parcel 2” on the plat entitled “A Final Subdivision and Property Line Adjustment Plat of TMS 275-00-00-260 – Daniel Island, Fairchild Street, owned by DIEC II, LLC, Located in the City of Charleston, Berkeley County, South Carolina”.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “We’re good.”

The Clerk said, “Yes. Councilmember Shahid was with me on that.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “I see.”

Councilmember Shahid said, “Thank you.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Committee on Ways and Means.”

Councilmember Seekings said, “So moved.”

Councilmember Mitchell said, “Second.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “We have a motion to approve and a second.”

The Clerk said, “That includes the ordinances.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “That includes the ordinances.”

On a motion of Councilmember Seekings, seconded by Councilmember Mitchell, City Council voted to adopt the Committee on Ways and Means Report as presented:

---INSERT WAYS AND MEANS REPORT---

(Bids and Purchases

(Budget Finance and Revenue Collections: Approval to transfer funds in the amount of \$199,061 from the Emergency Fund line-item to cover expenditures for Hurricane Matthew

(Budget Finance and Revenue Collections: Request approval of the Year 2016 Amendment to General Fund & Enterprise Funds Expenditure Budget [Ordinance]

(Budget Finance and Revenue Collections: Request approval of the Year 2016 Amendment to General Fund & Enterprise Funds Revenue Budget [Ordinance]

(Office of Cultural Affairs: Approval to apply for a Coastal Community Foundation Open Grant in the amount of \$10,000 for the Free Verse Festival, Charleston’s first poetry festival. Funds will be used for artistic fees and production costs. No City match is required.

(Office of Cultural Affairs: Approval to accept a grant award from the Gaylord and Dorothy Donnelley Foundation in the amount of \$5,000 to support the 2017 Piccolo Spoleto Festival. Funds will be used to support performances during the Festival. No City match is required.

- (Recreation: Approve the Contract between the City of Charleston and the Charleston County School District to purchase meals to be served during the summer for children who participate in the school free/reduced lunch program. Funding is provided through the SC Department of Education to the City of Charleston as the local sponsoring agency.
- (Recreation: Approve the Contract between the City of Charleston and the Lowcountry Food Bank to purchase meals to be served during the summer for children who participate in the school free/reduced lunch program. Funding is provided through the SC Department of Education to the City of Charleston as the local sponsoring agency.
- (Approval of a Memorandum of Understanding from Sky Garden Developers
- (Approval of 2017-2018 Vendor Spaces
- (Approval of 2017-2018 Bid Specifications for Street Vendor Spaces
- (Approval of 2017-2018 Franchise Agreement for Vendor Spaces
- (Approval of a facility rental with Bethel United Methodist Church for Piccolo Spoleto Festival of Churches and Synagogues on June 2, 3, 4, and 10, 2017 (57 Pitt Street)
- (Authorize the Mayor to purchase the above referenced property from Walter Jaudon for the sum of \$50,000. The property is strategically located at the entrance of the Maryville-Ashleyville neighborhoods and provides the City an opportunity to bring much needed affordable homeownership to West Ashley. An adjacent parcel [TMS: 418-11-00-205] was purchased in 2015. This acquisition will allow for the complete development of the gateway to the neighborhood. The funds for this acquisition will be derived from HOME Investment Partnerships program income. [TMS: 418-11-00-206; 0 Hillsboro Street]
- (Request approval for the Mayor to execute the attached Agreement to Buy and Sell Real Estate whereby the City intends to purchase 2.52 acres at the intersection of Highway 7 and Highway 171 from Faison-Sumar Street, LLC for \$3,029,500 (TMS: 352-08-00-006; Intersection of Highway 7 and 171). The property is owned by Faison-Sumar Street, LLC. [Councilmember Lewis voted nay.]
- (Request approval for the Mayor to execute the Memorandum of Understanding whereby East Line Partners LLC 1) intends to purchase a 0.57 acre parcel (bound by Meeting Street on the east, Sheppard Street on the south and I-26 ramps on the north and west) from SC DOT, and 2) transfer approximately 0.28 acres of the parcel to the City of Charleston as a linear park connection following completion of their development. (TMS: 459-05-03-138; Sheppard Street). The property is owned by East Line Partners, LLC. [Councilmember Lewis voted nay.]
- (Request approval for the Mayor to execute the Third Amendment to the Lease for 3 Lockwood whereby the rent due from Charleston Marine Holdings (Tenant) for the first extension period is set in accordance with the Lease and 2nd Amendment, and the City grants one additional five year extension. (TMS: 460-14-00-016; 3 Lockwood). The property is owned by the City of Charleston.
- (Request approval for Mayor to consent to terminate the Cannon Street YMCA's grant of 15 foot ingress-egress easement on YMCA's Cannon Street property to Smith Morris, LLC (now Gathering at Morris Square) (TMS: 460-12-01-008; 61 Cannon Street). The property is owned by Cannon Street YMCA.
- (Consider the following annexations:
- (i) Properties on Maybank Highway and Zelasko Drive (TMS# 313-00-00-071; and 313-00-00-072, 073, 231, 252, 332) 20.858 acres, Johns Island (District 5). The property is owned by the Estate of Thomas S. Morris.

- (ii) 3037 Maybank Highway (TMS# 313-00-00-075) 5.578 acres, Johns Island (District 5). The property is owned by Julian and Constance Kornahrens.
- (iii) A portion of 2115 River Road (TMS# 345-00-00-067) 6.13 acres, Johns Island (District 5). The property is owned by Susan P. Polk and Laurie Edward Polk.
- (iv) Property known as Bees Ferry Road and Hughes Road (TMS# 287-00-00-054 and 287-00-00-347) 12.439 acres, West Ashley (District 5). The property is owned by heirs of Phillis Washington.
- (An ordinance authorizing the Mayor to execute on behalf of the City the necessary documents to effectuate the land transfers contemplated by the Fourth Amendment to the Daniel Island Development Agreement, to include but not be limited to: a trail easement to Daniel Island Town Association, Inc.; a deed to Daniel Island Town Association, Inc. pertaining to City owned property bearing TMS No. 275-00-00-148 (Lot 1, Parcel R, Block O), along with an assignment of U.S. Army Corps of Engineers permit no. 200O-IP-319; a deed to Daniel Island Town Association, Inc. pertaining to property to be received by the City that will comprise a waterfront park; and a ground lease to Daniel Island Town Association, Inc. pertaining to City owned property comprised of 32.340 acres (Parcel AA, Phase 5) and 19.812 acres (Parcel AA, Phase 2) and a mortgage satisfaction.
- (Approval to grant a License to Daniel Island Town Association, Inc. to access City-owned property on Daniel Island comprised of 32.340 acres (Parcel AA, Phase 5) and 19.812 acres (Parcel AA, Phase 2) prior to the execution of a Ground Lease to enable the property to be grassed and otherwise timely prepared for recreational use, provided the form of the License is approved by Corporation Counsel.

First reading was given to the following bills:

An ordinance to make additional appropriations to meet the liabilities of the City of Charleston for the fiscal year ending December 31, 2016.

An ordinance to recognize the usage of additional funds to meet additional appropriations authorized by ordinance 2017-_____ for the fiscal year ending December 31, 2016

An ordinance to provide for the annexation of property known as properties on Maybank Highway and Zelasko Drive (20.858 acre) (TMS# 313-00-00-071; and 313-00-00-072, 073, 231, 252, 332), Johns Island, Charleston County, to the City of Charleston, shown within the area annexed upon a map attached hereto and make it part of District 5. The property is owned by estate of Thomas S. Morris.

An ordinance to provide for the annexation of property known as 3037 Maybank Highway (5.578 acre) (TMS# 313-00-00-075), Johns Island, Charleston County, to the City of Charleston, shown within the area annexed upon a map attached hereto and make it part of District 5. The property is owned by Julian & Constance Kornahrens.

An ordinance to provide for the annexation of property known as a portion of 2115 River Road (6.13 acre) (a portion of TMS# 345-00-00-067), Johns Island, Charleston County, to the City of Charleston, shown within the area annexed upon a map attached hereto and make it part of District 5. The property is owned by Susan P. Polk & Laurie Edward Polk.

An ordinance to provide for the annexation of property known as Bees Ferry Road and Hughes Road (12.439 acre) (TMS# 287-00-00-054; and 287-00-00-347), West Ashley, Charleston County, to the City of Charleston, shown within the area annexed upon a

map attached hereto and make it part of District 5. The property is owned by heirs of Phillis Washington.

An ordinance authorizing the Mayor to execute on behalf of the City the necessary documents to effectuate the land transfers contemplated by the Fourth Amendment to the Daniel Island Development Agreement, to include but not be limited to: a trail easement to Daniel Island Town Association, Inc.; a deed to Daniel Island Town Association, Inc. pertaining to City owned property bearing TMS No. 275-00-00-148 (Lot 1, Parcel R, Block O), along with an assignment of U.S. Army Corps of Engineers permit no. 2000-IP-319; a deed to Daniel Island Town Association, Inc. pertaining to property to be received by the City that will comprise a waterfront park; and a ground lease to Daniel Island Town Association, Inc. pertaining to City owned property comprised of 32.340 acres (Parcel AA, Phase 5) and 19.812 acres (Parcel AA, Phase 2) and a mortgage satisfaction.

The vote was not unanimous. Councilmember Lewis voted nay on Items 13(c) and 13(d) of the report.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next, bills up for second reading."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "K-1 and K-2."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have K-1 and K-2. Is there any discussion?"

On a motion of Councilmember Mitchell, two (2) bills (Items K-1 and K-2) received second reading. They passed second reading on motion by Councilmember Seekings and third reading on motion of Councilmember Mitchell. On further motion of Councilmember Seekings, the rules were suspended, and the bills were immediately ratified as:

2017-057 AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO EXECUTE ON BEHALF OF THE CITY A QUIT-CLAIM DEED TO MELZA R. VAN ROIJEN PERTAINING TO PROPERTY LOCATED AT 88 MORRIS STREET, TMS NO. 450-15-02-031.

2017-058 AN ORDINANCE TO PROVIDE FOR THE ANNEXATION OF PROPERTY KNOWN AS 2240 PINEHURST AVENUE (0.30 ACRE) (TMS# 358-15-00-023), WEST ASHLEY, CHARLESTON COUNTY, TO THE CITY OF CHARLESTON, SHOWN WITHIN THE AREA ANNEXED UPON A MAP ATTACHED HERETO AND MAKE IT PART OF DISTRICT 2. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY CHRIS MASON.

The Clerk said, "We do have the first reading, it's a zoning."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We do have one bill up for first reading. It's a zoning matter on Bees Ferry Road and Hughes Road. It's a Single-Family Residential classification."

Councilmember Williams said, "Move for approval."

Councilmember Lewis said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "This is in Councilmember Wagner's District. Is there any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Williams, seconded by Councilmember Lewis, City Council voted unanimously to give first reading to the following bill:

An ordinance to amend the Zoning Ordinance of the City of Charleston by changing the Zone Map, which is a part thereof, so that Bees Ferry Road and Hughes Road (West Ashley) (approximately 12.439 acres) (TMS #287-00-00-054 and 287-00-00-347) (Council District 5), be zoned Single-Family Residential (SR-1) classification. The property is owned by the heirs of Phillis Washington.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "If you all will bear me just a half a minute to sign these ordinances, the next meeting will be a Special Meeting next Tuesday, May 30th right here in City Hall Chambers. We are going to have a quick Executive Session to bring you up to date on our Gaillard litigation. The next Regular Meeting of Council will be on June 20th."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shahid has a question."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Shahid.

Councilmember Shahid said, "Regarding the question about moving the July Council meeting, has that been taken care of?"

The Clerk said, "I sent an e-mail to Councilmembers for July 11th, and I have gotten several responses, and it looks as though we will have a quorum. So, the question is, is July 11th okay for the Council meeting, as opposed to the Regular Meeting which was the 20th?"

Councilmember Williams said, "Yes."

The Clerk said, "Okay, thanks."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Okay, thank you."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Can we make that official?"

The Clerk said, "You're a 'yes'."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Could I still have order, please? Could I make an executive suggestion given that four Councilmembers are now absent, and I must admit the update about the Gaillard is not a pressing matter, that we defer our Executive Session until our Special Meeting next week? Is that okay with everyone?"

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Yes, so moved."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, we're going to defer that until the next meeting, is that alright, Councilmember Seekings?"

Councilmember Seekings said, "Yes, sir."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Okay, is there any further business?"

No one asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Hearing none, this meeting is adjourned. Thank you."

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:36 p.m.

Vanessa Turner Maybank
Clerk of Council